

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <i>Dedication</i> .....  | iii |
| <i>Preface</i> .....   | v   |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> .....   | vii |
| <i>Table of Cases</i> .....  | xix |
| <br>   |     |
| Chapter 1 A BRIEF HISTORY OF FORENSIC EVIDENCE .....   | 1   |
| 1. INTRODUCTION .....  | 1   |
| Evidence Dynamics: Locard's Exchange Principle<br>& Crime Reconstruction .....   | 2   |
| 1.1. Comments and Further Reading .....  | 10  |
| Juror Expectations for Scientific Evidence in<br>Criminal Cases: Perceptions and Reality about<br>the "CSI Effect" Myth..... | 11  |
| 1.2. Further Reading .....   | 24  |
| Chapter 2 THE ROLE OF THE POLICE, PROSECUTORS, DEFENCE<br>COUNSEL AND JUDGES. ....   | 27  |
| 1. INTRODUCTION.....   | 27  |
| 2. THE ROLE OF THE POLICE.....   | 28  |
| Editorial: The Police and the Public.....  | 28  |
| 2.1 Discussion.....  | 29  |
| United States v. Wade .....  | 30  |
| 2.2 Questions .....  | 34  |
| R. v. McArthur .....   | 34  |
| 2.3 Discussion.....  | 41  |
| R. v. Hennessey .....  | 42  |
| R. v. Singh .....  | 46  |
| 3. THE ROLE OF THE PROSECUTOR .....  | 52  |
| R. v. Boucher .....  | 52  |
| 3.1 Discussion & Question .....  | 54  |
| Berger v. United States .....  | 54  |
| 3.2 Question .....   | 59  |
| R. v. Babos .....  | 59  |
| R. v. Rose .....   | 63  |
| R. v. Rosik.....   | 69  |
| 3.3 Comment .....  | 73  |
| 4. THE ROLE OF THE DEFENCE COUNSEL.....  | 74  |
| The Law Society of Upper Canada.....   | 74  |
| 4.1 Comments & Further Reading .....   | 77  |
| R. v. Butt .....   | 78  |
| R. c. Deslisle .....   | 79  |

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
|           | R. v. Li.....   | 84  |
|           | North Carolina v. Alford.....                                       | 92  |
|           | 4.2 Comment & Further Reading .....                                 | 95  |
|           | R. v. Murray .....  | 96  |
|           | 4.3 Questions & Further Reading .....                               | 110 |
|           | R. v. Cottrell .....  | 110 |
|           | 4.4 Note .....  | 116 |
| 5.        | THE ROLE OF THE JUDGE.....  | 116 |
|           | Ethical Principles for Judges .....                                 | 116 |
|           | R. v. Baltovich .....   | 130 |
|           | 5.1 Comment & Question .....  | 141 |
|           | R. v. Brown.....  | 141 |
|           | 5.2 Further Reading .....   | 156 |
|           | R. v. Gushman .....   | 157 |
|           | 5.3 Comment .....   | 169 |
|           | R. v. Pompeo .....  | 169 |
|           | 5.4 Comment .....   | 174 |
|           | In re Complaint Concerning the Honourable<br>Alberto O. Miera ..... | 174 |
|           | 5.5 Comment .....   | 185 |
| Chapter 3 | DIRECT, CIRCUMSTANTIAL, REAL AND<br>DEMONSTRATIVE EVIDENCE. . . . . | 187 |
|           | 1. INTRODUCTION.....  | 187 |
|           | 2. DIRECT EVIDENCE.....   | 188 |
|           | Missouri v. Famber .....  | 188 |
|           | 2.1 Further Reading .....   | 190 |
|           | R. v. Williams.....   | 190 |
|           | 2.2 Note .....  | 191 |
|           | R. v. Mitchell .....  | 192 |
|           | Missouri v. McClure.....  | 193 |
|           | Oregon v. Baker .....   | 195 |
|           | 2.3 Comment & Question .....  | 197 |
|           | 3. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE.....                                     | 197 |
|           | R. v. O'Donnell.....  | 197 |
|           | 3.1 Comment & Question .....  | 204 |
|           | People v. Yokum .....   | 204 |
|           | R. v. Charemski.....  | 208 |
|           | 3.2 Question .....  | 213 |
|           | R. v. Arcuri.....   | 213 |
|           | 3.3 Further Reading .....   | 219 |
|           | 4. REAL EVIDENCE.....   | 219 |
|           | Riggie v. Grand Trunk Railway Company.....                          | 219 |

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
|           | Gutman v. Industrial Commission .....   | 221 |
| 4.1       | Note .....  | 223 |
|           | People v. Kinney .....  | 223 |
|           | Western Cottonoil Company v. Adkisson .....   | 225 |
|           | R. v. Mondor .....  | 226 |
| 4.2       | Further Reading .....   | 227 |
| 5.        | DEMONSTRATIVE EVIDENCE .....  | 228 |
|           | R. v. Bannister .....   | 228 |
| 5.1       | Comment & Question .....  | 228 |
|           | Smith v. Ohio Oil Company .....   | 229 |
|           | R. v. Lavery .....  | 230 |
| 5.2       | Comment .....   | 232 |
|           | R. v. McDonald .....  | 232 |
| 5.3       | Questions .....   | 241 |
|           | R. v. Collins .....   | 241 |
|           | The Law Society of Upper Canada Special<br>Lectures 2003:<br>The Law of Evidence: Roger G. Oatley,<br>“Demonstrative Evidence: Uses and Abuses” ... | 252 |
| Chapter 4 | DISCLOSURE, CONFIDENTIAL RECORDS AND<br>PRIVILEGE .....   | 259 |
| 1.        | INTRODUCTION .....  | 259 |
| 2.        | DISCLOSURE .....  | 259 |
|           | R. v. Stinchcombe .....   | 259 |
| 2.1       | Comments & Further Reading .....  | 270 |
|           | Ontario, Report of the Attorney General’s<br>Advisory Committee on Charge Screening,<br>Disclosure and Resolution Discussions .....                 | 271 |
|           | Brady v. Maryland .....   | 283 |
| 2.2       | Further Reading .....   | 284 |
|           | R. Hutter .....   | 284 |
| 2.3       | Discussion Questions & Further Reading .....  | 289 |
|           | R. v. Cleghorn .....  | 289 |
| 2.4       | Question .....  | 292 |
|           | R. v. Witter .....  | 292 |
| 2.5       | Note .....  | 299 |
|           | Washington v. Huson .....   | 299 |
|           | R. v. Sweeney .....   | 301 |
|           | R. v. Worth .....   | 306 |
|           | R. v. G.E.M. .....  | 309 |
| 2.6       | Comment & Questions .....   | 311 |

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
| 3.        | CONFIDENTIAL RECORDS.....   | 311 |
|           | R. v. O'Connor .....  | 311 |
| 3.1       | Note & Further Reading.....   | 316 |
|           | R. v. Carosella.....  | 316 |
| 3.2       | Question & Further Reading.....   | 324 |
|           | R. v. Mills .....   | 324 |
|           | R. v. McNeil .....  | 340 |
| 3.3       | Comment.....  | 351 |
| 4.        | PRIVILEGE .....   | 351 |
|           | Solosky v. R.....   | 351 |
| 4.1       | Comment.....  | 353 |
|           | Desôteaux c. Mierzwinski .....  | 353 |
|           | R. v. Couture .....   | 358 |
|           | R. v. Nguyen.....   | 363 |
| 4.2       | Questions & Comment.....  | 374 |
|           | R. v. Gruenke.....  | 375 |
| 4.3       | Note .....  | 379 |
|           | Tarasoff v. The Regents of the University of<br>California .....  | 379 |
| 4.4       | Note & Questions .....  | 383 |
|           | Smith v. Jones .....  | 383 |
|           | Named Person v. Vancouver Sun.....  | 393 |
| 4.5       | Further Reading .....   | 405 |
| Chapter 5 | COURTS AND TRIBUNALS .....  | 407 |
| 1.        | INTRODUCTION.....   | 407 |
|           | Supreme Court of Canada .....   | 408 |
|           | Administrative Tribunals and the Courts: An<br>Evolutionary Relationship .....                            | 412 |
|           | Pasiachnyk v. Saskatchewan (Workers'<br>Compensation Board).....  | 419 |
| 1.1       | Comment & Further Reading .....   | 433 |
|           | Pushpanathan v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship<br>& Immigration) .....                                   | 433 |
| 1.2       | Question .....  | 439 |
|           | Ocean Port Hotel Ltd. v. British Columbia<br>(General Manager, Liquor Control &<br>Licensing Branch)..... | 439 |
|           | Committee for Justice & Liberty v. Canada<br>(National Energy Board) .....                                | 442 |
| 1.3       | Comments & Further Reading .....  | 450 |
| Chapter 6 | OVERSIGHT LEGISLATION AND RULES USED<br>BY GOVERNING BODIES .....   | 451 |
| 1.        | INTRODUCTION.....   | 451 |

|           |  |     |
|-----------|--|-----|
|           | Foxes, Henhouses, Unfathomable Mysteries, and the Sufferance of the People: A Review of Regulating Professions and Occupations ..... | 451 |
| 1.1       | Comment & Question .....   | 461 |
|           | What Does It Mean to Be a Self-governing Regulated Profession? .....   | 461 |
| 1.2       | Note .....   | 470 |
| 2.        | THE MEDICAL PROFESSION.....  | 471 |
|           | Im (Re).....   | 471 |
| 2.1       | Comment .....  | 474 |
|           | Awad (Re).....   | 474 |
| 2.2       | Comment .....  | 479 |
| 3.        | THE NURSING PROFESSION.....  | 479 |
|           | Discipline Committee of the College of Nurses of Ontario .....   | 479 |
| 3.1       | Question .....   | 493 |
|           | Discipline Committee of the College of Nurses of Ontario .....   | 493 |
| 4.        | THE ENGINEERING PROFESSION .....   | 504 |
|           | Summary of Decision and Reasons.....   | 504 |
| 4.1       | Question .....   | 508 |
|           | Summary of Decision and Reasons.....   | 508 |
| 4.2       | Comment & Further Reading .....  | 511 |
| 5.        | THE PROFESSION OF SOCIAL WORKING .....   | 511 |
|           | Discipline Decision Summary .....  | 511 |
| 5.1       | Comment & Question .....   | 514 |
|           | Discipline Decision Summary .....  | 515 |
| 5.2       | Comment .....  | 518 |
| 6.        | THE PROFESSION OF ACCOUNTING .....   | 518 |
|           | Bull (Re).....   | 518 |
| 6.1       | Comment & Questions .....  | 525 |
|           | Strohyj (Re).....  | 525 |
| 6.2       | Comment .....  | 532 |
| Chapter 7 | TRIAL DELAYS AND ISSUES PERTAINING TO MEMORY. ....   | 533 |
| 1.        | INTRODUCTION.....  | 533 |
|           | Bedeviled by Delay: Straight Talk About Memory Loss, Procedural Manipulation and the Myth of Swift Justice.....                      | 534 |
| 1.1       | Comment & Question .....   | 543 |
|           | Barker v. Wingo .....  | 543 |
| 1.2       | Comment & Further Reading .....  | 551 |
|           | United States v. Lovasco .....   | 552 |
| 1.3       | Comment & Further Reading .....  | 557 |

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
|           | R. v. Askov .....   | 557 |
|           | 1.4 Note & Question .....   | 568 |
|           | R. v. Morin .....   | 568 |
|           | 1.5 Comment & Questions .....   | 585 |
|           | R. v. R.D.R. ....   | 585 |
|           | 1.6 Questions .....   | 590 |
|           | R. v. Jordan .....  | 590 |
|           | 1.7 Comments and Further Reading .....  | 598 |
| Chapter 8 | <b>CHALLENGING AND ADMITTING EXPERT<br/>TESTIMONY</b> .....                     | 599 |
|           | 1. INTRODUCTION .....   | 599 |
|           | Frye v. United States .....   | 600 |
|           | 1.1 Comment & Further Reading .....   | 601 |
|           | Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals Inc. ....                                | 602 |
|           | 1.2 Comment .....   | 607 |
|           | R. v. Mohan .....   | 608 |
|           | 1.3 Question .....  | 613 |
|           | R. v. Fatima .....  | 613 |
|           | 1.4 Comment & Questions .....   | 615 |
|           | R. v. Zqezharyk .....   | 615 |
|           | 1.5 Note .....  | 627 |
|           | R. v. Marquard .....  | 628 |
|           | 1.6 Comment .....   | 636 |
|           | R. v. Giroux .....  | 636 |
|           | 1.7 Comments .....  | 645 |
|           | Blank v. Canada (Department of Justice) .....                                   | 645 |
|           | 1.8 Comment .....   | 652 |
|           | R. v. Medwid .....  | 652 |
|           | 1.9 Comment .....   | 655 |
|           | R. v. Ghorvei .....   | 656 |
|           | 1.10 Comment & Question .....   | 660 |
|           | R. v. Karaibrahimovic .....   | 660 |
|           | 1.11 Comment .....  | 664 |
|           | Desbiens v. Mordini .....   | 664 |
|           | 1.12 Comment .....  | 667 |
|           | White Burgess Langille Inman v. Abbott and<br>Haliburton Co. ....               | 668 |
|           | 1.13 Comment .....  | 680 |
| Chapter 9 | <b>ETHICALITY, JUNK SCIENCE AND THE<br/>MISCARRIAGE OF JUSTICE</b> .....        | 681 |
|           | 1. INTRODUCTION .....   | 681 |
|           | When “Experts” Speak, Should Judges Listen:<br>Some Basic Science Lessons ..... | 681 |
|           | 1.1 Comments .....  | 689 |
|           | Expert Witness Ethics .....   | 689 |
|           | 1.2 Comment & Further Reading .....   | 699 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Ethicality and the Expert Witness: Remembering<br>What Hangs in the Balance .....        | 699 |
| 1.3 Comment & Question .....   | 703 |
| Ontario, <i>The Commission on Proceedings Involving<br/>        Guy Paul Morin</i> ..... | 703 |
| 1.4 Comment & Question .....   | 717 |
| R. v. Bianco .....   | 718 |
| 1.5 Comment .....  | 724 |
| R. v. Paul .....   | 724 |
| 1.6 Comment .....  | 734 |
| R. v. Lawrence .....   | 735 |
| 1.7 Note .....   | 738 |
| Ontario, <i>Inquiry into Pediatric Forensic<br/>        Pathology in Ontario</i> .....   | 738 |
| 1.8 Comment .....  | 752 |
| R. v. Kumar .....  | 752 |
| 1.9 Comments & Questions.....  | 761 |
| R. v. Olscamp.....   | 761 |
| 1.10 Further Reading.....  | 772 |
| Banks v. State.....  | 772 |
| 1.11 Further Reading.....  | 776 |
| Pierce v. Gilchrist .....  | 777 |
| 1.12 Note & Questions.....   | 785 |
| R. v. Palombi .....  | 785 |
| R. v. Truscott.....  | 789 |
| 1.13 Comment .....   | 814 |
| <i>Index</i> .....   | 815 |